The Large Marine Ecosystem (LME) Governance Framework as a model for the Wider Caribbean Region

Lucia Fanning¹, Robin Mahon², Patrick McConney²

¹ Marine Affairs Program, Dalhousie University
Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada

²Centre for Resource Management and Environmental Studies
The University of the West Indies, Barbados

Building a science-policy interface for ocean governance in the Wider Caribbean

Association of Caribbean States - Caribbean Sea Commission
Expert Consultation on Operationalisation of the Caribbean Sea Commission
University of the West Indies, Cave Hill Campus, Barbados, July 7-9, 2010
Format

- Terminology
- Why do we need a governance framework?
- What is its purpose?
- How should it be designed?
**Terminology**

*(Young 2008)*

**Governance:**
Process of steering or guiding societies towards socially desirable collective outcomes and away from those that are undesirable.

**Institution:**
A cluster of rights, rules and decision-making procedures that give rise to social practice, assigns roles and responsibilities and guides interactions among the occupants of the roles.

**Governance system:**
An institutional arrangement (formal and informal) created to perform the function of governance with regard to a specific society and a specific issue(s).

**Organisation:**
An entity responsible for administering rights, rules and decision-making procedures, i.e. members share a common purpose.
Context-Driven Elements of the Decision-Making Process

- **WHO?** (key actors)
- **WHERE?** (location)
- **WHY?** (public values, objectives and criteria)
- **HOW?**

External Factors

Rights, rules, decision-making procedures specifying roles and nature of interactions
Factors affecting quality of decision-making outcomes – 4 P’s

- Identification of the nature of the problem and understanding of it by the key players (organizations and individuals);

- Assessment of the politics, political structures and policies causing and affecting the implementation of possible solutions to the problem;

- Level of information gathering on the characteristics of the players and the motivation behind their possible exercise of influence; and,

- Assessment of current practices and metapRACTices that can affect possible solutions.
Why do we need an effective LME governance framework?

- **Human-dominated Ecosystems**
  - Coastal development
  - Pollution
  - Over-exploitation
  - Climate change

- **Institutions serve as a major determinant in advancing key principles**
  - Equity
  - Efficiency
  - Sustainability
Issues of large scale and complexity in the Wider Caribbean

- Lots of technical work has been done
- Has little impact on governance
- Many local efforts at management
- Uncoordinated and disconnected at regional level
- Duplication of effort
What is its purpose?

To address 3 interrelated orders of human activities in the Caribbean Sea:

- **Problem solving** or day-to-day management of a particular issue that has been identified.

- The **institutional frameworks and arrangements** in place for solving problems associated with the issue.

- Overarching **meta-governance**, which is about the principles and values that underlie the institutional frameworks.
Natural resource scale

- Large pelagics
- Reef fishes
- Flyingfish
- Shrimps
Institutional Scale
Overlapping and nested fisheries related organisations

WECAFC
- Cuba
- *Aruba

ACS
- Venezuela
- *Puerto Rico**
- *Martinique***
- *Guadeloupe***
- *Netherlands Antilles
- *USVI**

WECAFC LAC

CARIFORUM
- Dominican Republic

CARICOM
- Barbados
- Belize
- Trinidad & Tobago
- *Turks & Caicos I.
- *Cayman I.

OECS
- St. Vincent & Grenadines
- St. Kitts & Nevis
- Antigua & Barbuda
- Dominica
- St. Lucia
- Grenada

OLDEPESCA
- Bolivia
- El Salvador
- Ecuador
- Peru

OSPESCA
- Costa Rica
- Guatemala
- Honduras
- Mexico
- Nicaragua
- Panama

Belize

Haiti
Guyana
Jamaica

* Associate States of ACS
** in ICCAT as USA
*** in ICCAT as French Departments
**** in ICCAT as UK
LME governance framework must embody some key properties as “one size does not fit all”:

- **Scale** - both geographical scale and institutional scale;
- **Context** – co-occurring of different types of context-specific governance interactions and processes;
- **Evaluative** - different scale and process appropriate indicators can be used in different parts of the framework; and,
- **Adaptive** - processes must be iterative on time scales that are appropriate to adaptation and learning.
Intervention Requirements of the Framework

- It must help to identify and reform institutions that are ‘misfits’ and unable to accommodate systems that are highly dynamic, multi-level and subject to a high degree of uncertainty;

- It must accommodate the interplay that necessarily exist between one set of institutional arrangements that exists for a given set of issues and another; and,

- It must allow for scaling to be used as a means to address equity concerns and to facilitate effort at all appropriate levels to solve problems.
A multi-level policy-cycle based governance framework

Must be:
• Complete
• Linked vertically
• Linked laterally

Diversity of cycles
LME Governance Framework

Global
- Global marine policy cycle

Regional
- Caribbean Sea regional policy cycle
- Tourism
- Fisheries
- Biodiversity
- Transportation
- Land-based pollution

National

Local
Governance framework diagnostic and priority-setting/interventionist advantages

Governance framework provides:

- Way for those involved at all levels to see where they fit in;
- Way to break the problem into manageable units through diagnosis;
- Targeted interventions to establish and/or enhance specific parts of the framework.
Building the LME Governance Framework
“Learning by doing”

Long-term goal
Fully-functional policy cycles at all appropriate levels with the appropriate vertical and lateral linkages.

Framework building interventions
- Interventions can be:
  - Approached incrementally by targeting deficient areas
  - Specifically targeted at:
    1. Establishing or completing policy cycles
    2. Building or enhancing linkages